



# Governor's Office of Storm Recovery



Andrew M. Cuomo  
Governor

Lisa Bova-Hiatt  
Interim Executive Director

## Meeting Minutes of July 16, 2015 Living Breakwaters Citizens Advisory Committee

### *Meeting #1*

July 16, 2015  
CYO-MIV Community Center  
6541 Hylan Blvd, Staten Island, NY  
7:00 pm – 9:00 pm

#### **1. Introductions**

##### **In attendance were the following Living Breakwaters CAC members:**

James Pistilli, Victoria Cerullo, Debra Amoroso, Phyllis Broughton, Edward Canlon, Kerry Halvorsen, Albert Klingele, John Malizia, Nicole Nigro, Pamela Pettyjohn, Anthony Reinhart, Frank Santarpia, Bill Shadel and Diane Silverman

##### **In attendance were the following Governor's Office of Storm Recovery (GOSR) Representatives:**

Daniel Greene, Kate Dineen, Christopher McNamara and Alex Zablocki

Members of the public and representatives from various government agencies were also in attendance.

#### **2. CAC Roles and Responsibilities**

The GOSR discussed the roles and responsibilities of the CAC including:

##### CAC Roles & Responsibilities

**Review:** Receive updates on the project as it progresses from conceptual development through environmental review into design and eventually construction

**Engage:** Provide updates to and receive feedback from the larger community through innovative forms of engagement

**Advise:** Advise the State on design and potential impacts of the project

**Collaborate:** Work with the State on identifying alternative funding sources for part of the project and work to identify stakeholders on monitoring of the project post-construction

### **3. Living Breakwaters and Tottenville Dune Project Overview**

GOSR provided an overview of both the Living Breakwaters and Tottenville Dune projects

### **4. Project Status and Updates**

GOSR provided an update on both projects, including continuation of the environmental review. GOSR provided an update on the various environmental studies and a summary of the some of the comments received through the public comment period, including tie-in coastal protection measures to higher ground, community impacts of the project (ie: traffic, construction, etc.), level of risk reduction of the project, and public access to water and beach.

### **5. Next Steps**

GOSR discussed next steps in the environmental review and design of both projects, including the ongoing Coordination with State, City and Federal partners, as well as design teams.

### **6. CAC Questions and Comments**

#### **CAC Member Comment/Question**

Question: What's the role of DEC?

GOSR: Their primary role is permitting; we've (GOSR) engaged them early.

Question: Will soil sampling on done on the grid? Or subset of the grid?

GOSR: It depends on what they are sampling for—some sampling necessitates more random sampling.

Question: On shore sampling too?

GOSR: Likely won't be a large on-shore soil investigation, but there may be some grabs. The primary focus is on grain size of sediment in the water column—grain size will be in input into model to tells how sand moves throughout the currents, which is a critical part of the analysis.

Question: Are manmade structures remnants of old docks?

GOSR: We can't tell through side scan sonar analysis, but divers will get a closer look. Very large datasets. (GOSR shows structure on map.)

GOSR: Tottenville Historical Society provided historic maps and aerial photos.

GOSR: We don't expect dredging to be part of this process, so we hope to design around obstructions.

Question: Thank you for the presentation—comprehensive overview of project, great partnership with library. Suggest you also utilize Conference House Park and CB3 offices.

GOSR: Great suggestion. We will also make MOU with City Parks and design contracts public.

Question: More of an inland concern—is the project going to examine inland drainage issues, particularly storm water runoff near Billop Street?

GOSR: The EIS will examine drainage issues and will work collaboratively with NYC DEP.

Question: Can Stantec join the community meeting with DEP regarding drainage issues with existing dune system?

GOSR: Please send us date of the meeting—would be great to have representative attend.

GOSR: We've been collaborating effectively with ORR and DEP.

Question: Suggest forming sub-committees with focused roles (for example: education, residents near construction impacts).

GOSR: Terrific—note that we won't be adding more official members to CAC over the 20 member cap, but sub-committees can informally engage additional members of the public.

GOSR: This is your canvas! (the CAC) One personal suggestion is that we have a long road ahead—think about most immediate issues first.

Comment: Phyllis and Diane at the Civic have been spearheading outreach.

Question: US Army Corps of Engineers (USACE) response was extensive—will “mitigation” be addressed?

GOSR: Yes, it will be an issue to address through USACE process—wetland displacement example, could be “self-mitigating” aspects as well, will address publically down the line.

Question: Agree with Jim re: sub-committees, will there be mingling of funds with Nassau project?

GOSR: No.

GOSR: Suggestion to establish consortium to fundraise and manage non-RBD funds.

Comment: Don't know exact locations of breakwaters or dunes

GOSR: Clarify funding, \$60 m dedicated to this project, by law State must spend on this project, it's also important to note that it's “scalable” within the project, dune is separately funded at \$6.75m.

Comment: CAC will want to review length/location of breakwater, dune, water hub etc., know the area

GOSR: That's exactly what your role will be, get your feedback, change things, advise on impacts and what you want to see

Comment: Set aside funding for long-term operation and maintenance (O&M)

GOSR: HUD notice outlines rules, including operation and maintenance

Comment: Alex has this way of finding money, may even have a wish list

Question: Is there an expiration date on this offer (funding)?

GOSR: Absolutely, there is a timeline, obligation of funds by 2019, waiver through 2022, confident we can implement within this range, aggressive schedule, contract has detailed milestones

Question: Will dunes be turned over to the City? Will they be responsible for O&M?

GOSR: Longer term O&M will be determined, on City property but in State, have an MOU early in the process

Comment: Consider creating consortium of entities to monitor

Question: Would it be possible to reprogram NY Rising funds?

GOSR: Staten Island NY Rising Community Reconstruction dollars must address 22 priority projects, so don't anticipate there is additional money on the table of the \$28 million to implement that plan

Question: What about reprogramming Ellis Street and Mill Basin projects?

GOSR: Let's map out projects in August to get everyone on the same page.

Question: What happens if we get hit by another storm during construction?

GOSR: Will have risk mitigation plans, consider seasonality and emergency plans to mitigate risk

Comment: Irene impacted Wolf's Pond project

Question: Will the project have managers/oversight to ensure contractor are building to spec?

GOSR: Absolutely, HUD also monitors us and puts certain regulations in place

### **Public Comment/Question**

Comment: Worried about elevation of breakwater system, high tide and low tide, would be nice maybe 6 feet high to help with storm surge

GOSR: USACE raised boating safety/visibility issues, will be above high tide and consider sea level rise as well

Question: *Question unknown.*

GOSR: Shipping channel is monitored by fed, have to study and monitor habitat, beach reclamation may be part of project, why we are taking sand samples to plug into models

Question: Thank you, concerns about ongoing monitoring, Parks is notorious for lack of maintenance, DEC understaffed and we don't want oysters to end up in fish shop, concerns about proximity of channel, who will own breakwaters?

GOSR: USACE has raised issues about channel, so it's being addressed, we hope State will own project on land underwater, DEC has raised issue of oyster poaching so it's being addressed

Comment: Suggests a project name: "The Big Oyster"

GOSR: Also Tottenville is known as the "The Town the Oyster Built"

Question: Can you make bathymetric studies available at library?

GOSR: Yes, will post on website and bring materials to library (Courtney [manager of the Tottenville Library] has the file); will bring final report to library.

Question: Do we have a definition of success and how to measure success?

GOSR: Within year we will develop design standards and raises questions about sizing, location and cost, will be bringing questions to CAC, goal is to have structure in water that reduces wave velocity and erosion, dune will reduce still water flooding to some level, also to restore habitat, educational goals as well

Question: Will breakwaters be marked for navigation?

GOSR: Yes will consult with Coast Guard and USACE

Question: USACE mitigation permit?

GOSR: Will have TA section with USACE to address 404, may include condition to do work elsewhere to mitigate, goal to get ACE permitting next year, HUD established SRIRC to expedite permitting

Question: Is there similar breakwater project implemented in Florida? What can we learn?

GOSR: Firm that built that the project (TetraTech) is a peer reviewer on the project, happy present at future CAC meeting and to circulate PPT, project is considered a success to date

Comment: Joint meeting of CAC and Tottenville Civic with TetraTech

Question: Can we post this information and distribute to membership lists?

GOSR: Absolutely!

Comment: I didn't know about this meeting, but found flyer in my mailbox

Comment: suggestion to have members face the public