

**Appendix F**  
**Historic and Cultural Resources Correspondence**

## ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

### Final Sign-Off (Multiple Sites)

**Project number:** GOVERNOR OFFICE STORM RECOVERY / 106-R  
**Project:** LIVING BREAKWATERS AND TOTTEVILLE DUNE PROJECTS  
**Date received:** 2/2/2015

**Comments:** as indicated below. Properties that are individually LPC designated or in LPC historic districts require permits from the LPC Preservation department. Properties that are S/NR listed or S/NR eligible require consultation with SHPO if there are State or Federal permits or funding required as part of the action.

---

The LPC is in receipt of the preliminary draft scope of work for EIS dated 1/30/15. The scope is acceptable for historic and cultural resources.

**Properties with Archaeological significance:**

1) ADDRESS: 850 PAGE AVENUE, BBL: 5077220001, PROPERTY NAME:  
TOTTEVILLE DUNE

LPC review of archaeological sensitivity models and historic maps indicates that there is potential for the recovery of remains from Native American occupation on the project site. Accordingly, the Commission recommends that an archaeological documentary study be performed for this site to clarify these initial findings and provide the threshold for the next level of review, if such review is necessary (see CEQR Technical Manual 2014).

**Properties with Architectural significance in the project radius/area:**

LPC AND S/NR LISTED : CONFERENCE HOUSE; LPC HEARD AND S/NR ELIGIBLE:  
PRINCE'S BAY LIGHTKEEPERS HOUSE (now a residence at the Mission of the Immaculate Conception, Mount Loretto, BBL: 7644/1).

Cc: SHPO



2/9/2015

---

SIGNATURE  
Gina Santucci, Environmental Review Coordinator

DATE

**File Name:** 30215\_FSO\_DNP\_02092015.doc

## View and/or Address a Response

## Project 15PR00618: Tottenville Shoreline, Staten Island (A7M3KF947H2O)

Please accept the following information below as the consolidated response from NYS SHPO for the above referenced submission.

## Review Responses

Reviewer	Review Type	Response
Larry Moss	Technical Services	More Information Requested
Daria Merwin	Survey and Evaluation	In order for SHPO to complete our evaluation of the historic significance of all buildings/structures/districts within or adjacent to your project area, we need further information. Please review the specific information request(s) below and click the Process button to respond to each request.
Philip Perazio	Archaeology	In order for SHPO to complete our evaluation of the Archaeological sensitivity of your project, we need further information. Please review the specific information request(s) below and click the Process button to respond to each request.

## Information Requests

Status	Reviewer	Review Type	Request Type	Request Entity	Request Item	Request Description
Information Requested	Daria Merwin	Survey and Evaluation	Request a New Attachment, Photo, or Survey for this Consultation Project		Survey	SHPO concurs with the proposed architectural resources analysis as described in the Environmental Impact Statement Draft Scope of Work. Please submit a report on the results of this investigation.
Information Requested	Philip Perazio	Archaeology	Request a New Attachment, Photo, or Survey for this Consultation Project		Survey	SHPO concurs with the proposed investigative actions regarding archaeological resources as described in the Environmental Impact Statement Draft Scope of Work. Please submit a report on the results of this investigation.

## **ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW**

**Project number:** GOVERNOR OFFICE STORM RECOVERY / 106-R/15PR00618  
**Project:** LIVING BREAKWATERS AND TOTTEVILLE DUNE PROJECTS  
**Date received:** 4/6/2015

**Comments:** as indicated below. Properties that are individually LPC designated or in LPC historic districts require permits from the LPC Preservation department. Properties that are S/NR listed or S/NR eligible require consultation with SHPO if there are State or Federal permits or funding required as part of the action.

---

The LPC is in receipt of the EIS draft scope of work dated 4/1/15. The text is acceptable for historic and cultural resources.

*Gina Santucci*

4/7/2015

SIGNATURE  
Gina Santucci, Environmental Review Coordinator

DATE

**File Name:** 30215\_FSO\_GS\_04072015.doc

Cc: SHPO  
MOEC

**View and/or Address a Response****Project 15PR00618: Tottenville Shoreline, Staten Island (3G1MET3PRRBL)**

Please accept the following information below as the consolidated response from NYS SHPO for the above referenced submission.

**Review Responses**

Reviewer	Review Type	Response
Philip Perazio	Archaeology	In order for SHPO to complete our evaluation of the Archaeological sensitivity of your project, we need further information. Please review the specific information request(s) below and click the Process button to respond to each request.

**Information Requests**

Status	Reviewer	Review Type	Request Type	Request Entity	Request Item	Request Description
Information Requested	Philip Perazio	Archaeology	Request a New Attachment, Photo, or Survey for this Consultation Project		Survey	SHPO concurs with the stated intent to conduct a Phase IA archaeological investigation. Please submit the Phase IA archaeological report via CRIS using the enclosed token.

**Attachments**

Attachment	Reviewer	Review Type	Type	Name	Description
------------	----------	-------------	------	------	-------------

No Attachment Records

## ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

**Project number:** GOVERNOR OFFICE STORM RECOVERY / 106-R  
**Project:** LIVING BREAKWATERS AND TOTTENVILLE DUNE PROJECTS  
**Date received:** 4/23/2015

**Comments:** as indicated below. Properties that are individually LPC designated or in LPC historic districts require permits from the LPC Preservation department. Properties that are S/NR listed or S/NR eligible require consultation with SHPO if there are State or Federal permits or funding required as part of the action.

---

**Properties with Archaeological significance:**

1) ADDRESS: 850 PAGE AVENUE, BBL: 5077220001, PROPERTY NAME:  
TOTTENVILLE DUNE

**Properties with Architectural significance:**

LPC AND S/NR LISTED : CONFERENCE HOUSE; LPC HEARD AND S/NR ELIGIBLE:  
PRINCE'S BAY LIGHTKEEPERS HOUSE (now a residence at the Mission of the  
Immaculate Conception, Mount Loretto, BBL: 7644/1).

**Comments:** LPC is in receipt of the revised: "Coastal and Social Resiliency Initiatives for Tottenville Shoreline, Staten Island, NY Environmental Impact Statement Draft Scope of Work". Please notify LPC if the geographic location, substance or content of the project changes. LPC review of archaeological sensitivity models and historic maps indicates that there is potential for the recovery of remains from Native American occupation on the project site. Accordingly, the Commission recommends that an archaeological topic intensive documentary study be performed for this project to clarify these initial findings and provide the threshold for the next level of review, if such review is necessary (see CEQR Technical Manual 2012).

Furthermore, the text should note that in addition to the 1997 Arnold Pickman report, additional archaeological work has occurred in the vicinity and should be reviewed as well as part of the scope for archaeology. These reports may be found here: <http://www.nyc.gov/html/lpc/html/publications/archaeology.shtml>

Cc: SHPO



5/1/2015

---

SIGNATURE  
Gina Santucci, Environmental Review Coordinator

DATE

**File Name:** 30215\_FSO\_DNP\_04292015.doc

## ***Stockbridge-Munsee Tribal Historic Preservation***

*Main Office  
W13447 Camp 14 Rd  
Bowler, WI 54416*

*New York Office  
65 First Street  
Troy, NY 12180*

Daniel Greene  
General Counsel, Interim  
Governor's Office of Storm Recovery  
25 Beaver Street  
New York, NY 10004  
*Via email only*

August 20, 2015

### **RE: Coastal & Social Resiliency Initiatives for Tottenville Shoreline, Richmond County NY Comments by Stockbridge-Munsee Mohican Tribe**

Dear Mr. Greene:

I am in receipt of project documents dated August 13, 2015 for the above-referenced project forwarded by AKRF consultants. We have reviewed the materials per our cultural resource responsibilities for Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act and are replying to in keeping with our Government-to-Government consultation.

On behalf of the Stockbridge-Munsee Mohican Tribe, I offer the following comments:

- The project is located within our cultural area of interest and we wish to continue consultation. While we do not immediately know of a cultural site located directly in the APE, we note that the APE has a likelihood for Native American sites.
- Therefore, we concur with the approach of conducting archeological fieldwork as described in the Environmental Impact Statement Draft Scope of Work.
- We ask that our tribe's Inadvertent Discovery Policy (attached) be incorporated into the archeological testing plan. We will review the archeological survey reports for the project when complete.

Thank you for your review of the comments of Stockbridge-Munsee Mohican Tribe.

Kind regards,



Bonney Hartley  
Tribal Historic Preservation Officer  
New York Office

Cc: Elizabeth Meade, AKRF, *via email only*

**Band of Mohican Indians**

**Stockbridge-Munsee Community**

**Policy for**

**Treatment and Disposition of Human Remains and Cultural Items  
That May be Discovered Inadvertently During Planned Activities**

**Purpose**

The purpose of this policy is to describe the procedures that will be followed by all federal agencies, in the event there is an inadvertent discovery of human remains, that are identified as Stockbridge-Munsee (Mohican).

**Treatment and Disposition of Human Remains and Cultural Items**

1. The federal agency shall contact the Stockbridge-Munsee President's office (715) 793-4111 or Stockbridge-Munsee Historic Preservation Office (715) 793-3970, after hours (715)304-8155, as soon as possible, but no later than three (3) days, after the discovery of Stockbridge-Munsee, Mohican remains
2. Place tobacco with the remains and funeral objects
3. Cover remains and funeral objects with a natural fiber cloth such as cotton or muslin when possible.
4. No photographs to be taken
5. The preferred treatment of inadvertently discovered human remains and cultural items is to leave human remains and cultural items in-situ and protect them from further disturbance.
6. Non-destructive "in-field" documentation of the remains and cultural items will be carried out in consultation with the Tribe, who may stipulate the appropriateness of certain methods of documentation.
7. If the remains and cultural items are left in-situ, no disposition takes place and the requirements of 43 CFR 10 Section 10.4-10.6 will have been fulfilled.
8. The specific locations of discovery shall be withheld from disclosure (with the exception of local law officials and tribal officials as described above) and protected to the fullest extent by federal law
9. If remains and funeral objects are to be removed from the site consultation will begin between the Stockbridge-Munsee Tribe and the federal agency.

## ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

**Project number:** GOVERNOR OFFICE STORM RECOVERY / 106-R  
**Project:** LIVING BREAKWATERS AND TOTTENVILLE DUNE PROJECTS  
**Date received:** 8/25/2015

**Comments:** as indicated below. Properties that are individually LPC designated or in LPC historic districts require permits from the LPC Preservation department. Properties that are S/NR listed or S/NR eligible require consultation with SHPO if there are State or Federal permits or funding required as part of the action.

---

### REVISED OF THIS DATE

**Properties with Archaeological significance:**

- 1) ADDRESS: 850 PAGE AVENUE, BBL: 5077220001, PROPERTY NAME:  
TOTTENVILLE DUNE

The proposed APE for the Proposed Actions appears reasonable for architecture and archaeology. In the event that in-ground construction is proposed within the APE for Indirect Effects, which has been defined to include the area on land for the construction of resilient dune structures and plantings on a portion of the Tottenville shoreline, existing and proposed conditions shall be provided to LPC for review and comment.

**Properties with Architectural significance:**

LPC AND S/NR LISTED : CONFERENCE HOUSE; LPC HEARD AND S/NR ELIGIBLE:  
PRINCE'S BAY LIGHTKEEPERS HOUSE (now a residence at the Mission of the Immaculate Conception, Mount Loretto, BBL: 7644/1).

Cc: SHPO



9/10/15

---

SIGNATURE  
Gina Santucci, Environmental Review Coordinator

DATE

**File Name:** 30215\_FSO\_DNP\_08282015.doc

[Close](#)

## View and/or Address a Response

**Project 15PR00618: Tottenville Shoreline, Staten Island (DHX4EELKMHMT)**

[View Project](#)

Please accept the following information below as the consolidated response from NYS SHPO for the above referenced submission.

### Review Responses

Reviewer	Review Type	Response
Daria Merwin	Survey and Evaluation	Concur with direct and indirect APE for architectural resources.
Philip Perazio	Archaeology	Based on the information provided, SHPO concurs with the "Direct Effect APE".
Larry Moss	Technical Services	The SHPO concurs regarding the definition of the APE for direct and indirect effects.

### Information Requests

Process	Status	Reviewer	Review Type	Request Type	Request Entity	Request Item	Request Description
<i>No Request Records</i>							

### Attachments

Attachment	Reviewer	Review Type	Type	Name	Description
<i>No Attachment Records</i>					



Elizabeth Meade &lt;emeade@akrf.com&gt;

---

**RE: Tottenville Shoreline Section 106 Consultation**

---

**Bonney Hartley** <Bonney.Hartley@mohican-nsn.gov>

Thu, Oct 20, 2016 at 4:10 PM

To: Elizabeth Meade &lt;emeade@akrf.com&gt;

Cc: "Daniel.Greene@stormrecovery.ny.gov" &lt;Daniel.Greene@stormrecovery.ny.gov&gt;, Shabana Tajwar &lt;stajwar@akrf.com&gt;, "Alex.Zablocki@stormrecovery.ny.gov" &lt;Alex.Zablocki@stormrecovery.ny.gov&gt;

Dear Elizabeth:

I have completed review of the Phase 1A. On behalf of Stockbridge-Munsee Community I confirm that we concur with the report recommendations that if the activities are limited to stockpiling with no ground disturbance, no further work is required. If the project plans will involve ground disturbance, we ask that the Phase 1B testing protocol be circulated for review and ongoing consultation.

Thank you,

Bonney

*Bonney Hartley*

Tribal Historic Preservation Officer

Stockbridge-Munsee Mohican Tribal Historic Preservation

New York Office

65 1st Street

Troy, NY 12180

(518) 244-3164

Bonney.Hartley@mohican-nsn.gov

[www.mohican-nsn.gov](http://www.mohican-nsn.gov)**From:** Elizabeth Meade [mailto:[emeade@akrf.com](mailto:emeade@akrf.com)]**Sent:** Tuesday, October 18, 2016 12:47 PM**To:** Bonney Hartley**Cc:** [Daniel.Greene@stormrecovery.ny.gov](mailto:Daniel.Greene@stormrecovery.ny.gov); Shabana Tajwar; [Alex.Zablocki@stormrecovery.ny.gov](mailto:Alex.Zablocki@stormrecovery.ny.gov)**Subject:** Re: Tottenville Shoreline Section 106 Consultation

Ms. Hartley--

On behalf of the New York State Governor's Office of Storm Recovery, I am pleased to provide you with the attached Section 106 consultation materials for the proposed Coastal and Social Resiliency Initiatives for the Tottenville Shoreline project located in Staten Island, Richmond County, New York. Please see the attached letter regarding the submission of the Draft Phase 1A Archaeological Documentary Study and a preliminary draft of the DEIS Historic and Cultural Resources Chapter. As the files are too large to send via email, we have uploaded them to an online transfer site, please see the login information below. If you have any trouble downloading the files or if you would prefer a paper copy of these documents, please do not hesitate to contact me. Paper copies of these materials have also been sent to President Shannon Holsey via USPS.

## AKRF WebFolders LogOn Instructions

Below are instructions for securely sending/receiving large files for project via AKRF's Extranet:

1. Click on (or otherwise navigate to): <https://nyctransfer.akrf.com>

Login with credentials:

Username: **BreakwatersCultural**

Password: **Section106**

[Please Note: Username and Password are cAsE sEnstive]

2. A window should appear where you can:
  1. Select extranet files to transfer to your computer; or
  2. Select files on your computer to transfer to the extranet.

We look forward to receiving your comments regarding these materials and to our continued consultation regarding this project.

Best,

Elizabeth

**Elizabeth D. Meade, RPA**

Technical Director/Archaeologist

.....  
**AKRF, INC.**

*Environmental, Planning, and Engineering Consultants*

440 Park Ave South , 7th Floor | New York , NY 10016

P) [646.388.9811](tel:646.388.9811) | F) [212.447.9942](tel:212.447.9942)

[www.akrf.com](http://www.akrf.com)

On Thu, Aug 20, 2015 at 1:38 PM, Bonney Hartley <[Bonney.Hartley@mohican-nsn.gov](mailto:Bonney.Hartley@mohican-nsn.gov)> wrote:

Dear Mr. Greene,

Attached please find Stockbridge-Munsee Mohican Tribe's comment letter and an additional document regarding the Tottenville Shoreline project.

Kind regards,  
Bonney

*Bonney Hartley*

Tribal Historic Preservation Officer

Stockbridge-Munsee Mohican Tribal Historic Preservation

New York Office

65 1st Street

Troy, NY 12180

(518) 244-3164

[Bonney.Hartley@mohican-nsn.gov](mailto:Bonney.Hartley@mohican-nsn.gov)

[www.mohican-nsn.gov](http://www.mohican-nsn.gov)

*Physical Address: 37 1<sup>st</sup> Street*

**From:** Elizabeth Meade [<mailto:emeade@akrf.com>]

**Sent:** Thursday, August 13, 2015 1:24 PM

**To:** Bonney Hartley

**Cc:** [Daniel.Greene@stormrecovery.ny.gov](mailto:Daniel.Greene@stormrecovery.ny.gov); George Penesis; Shabana Tajwar; Claudia Cooney; Wally Miller

**Subject:** Tottenville Shoreline Section 106 Consultation

Dear Ms. Hartley--

On behalf of the New York State Governor's Office of Storm Recovery, I am pleased to provide you with the attached letter inviting the Stockbridge-Munsee Community Band of Mohicans to participate as a consulting party for review of the proposed Coastal and Social Resiliency Initiatives for the Tottenville Shoreline project located in Staten Island, Richmond County, New York. The attached PDF contains a letter describing the proposed project, a map of the project site, and a copy of the Environmental Impact Statement Draft Scope of Work. As the file is large, if you could please confirm that you received the attachment, I would appreciate it. These materials have also been sent to President Wallace Miller via certified mail.

If you have any questions about the attached materials or if you require any additional information, please do not hesitate to contact me or Daniel Greene (copied here).

We look forward to hearing from you regarding this project.

Best,

Elizabeth

**Elizabeth D. Meade, RPA**

Technical Director/Archaeologist

.....  
**AKRF, INC.**

*Environmental, Planning, and Engineering Consultants*

440 Park Ave South , 7th Floor | New York , NY 10016

P) [646.388.9811](tel:646.388.9811) | F) [212.447.9942](tel:212.447.9942)

[www.akrf.com](http://www.akrf.com)

## ARCHAEOLOGY

**Project number:** GOVERNOR OFFICE STORM RECOVERY / 106-R  
**Project:** LIVING BREAKWATERS AND TOTTEVILLE DUNE PROJECTS  
**Date received:** 10/21/2016

---

**This document only contains Archaeological review findings. If your request also requires Architecture review, the findings from that review will come in a separate document.**

**Comments:** The LPC is in receipt of the DRAFT Phase 1A Archaeological Documentary Study Coastal and Social Resiliency Initiatives for the Tottenville Shoreline: Living Breakwaters and Tottenville Shoreline Protection Projects report dated October 2016. We have reviewed the draft report and concur with its findings. We request notification when the project design is finalized along with documentation of the potential for impact in areas of documented archaeological sensitivity. Please submit a final version in both electronic and hardcopy format.



10/26/2016

---

SIGNATURE  
Jessica MacLean, Urban Archaeologist

DATE

**File Name:** 30215\_FSO\_JSM\_10252016.doc



## Parks, Recreation, and Historic Preservation

**ANDREW M.  
CUOMO**

Governor

**ROSE HARVEY**

Commissioner

November 1, 2016

Mr. Daniel Greene  
Governor's Office of Storm Recovery  
25 Beaver St  
New York, NY 10004

Re: GOSR/ CDBG-DR  
Tottenville Shoreline, Staten Island/ Richmond County  
15PR00618

Dear Mr. Greene:

Thank you for requesting the comments of the New York State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO). We have reviewed the provided documentation in accordance with Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act of 1966. These comments are those of the SHPO and relate only to Historic/Cultural resources. They do not include other environmental impacts to New York State Parkland that may be involved in or near your project. Such impacts must be considered as part of the environmental review of the project pursuant to the National Environmental Policy Act and/or the State Environmental Quality Review Act (New York Environmental Conservation Law Article 8).

We have reviewed the scope of work and supporting documents submitted to our office to date. Based upon our review, we understand that the project area appears to contain archaeological resources and that there may be the potential for indirect effects to above-ground historic resources. SHPO has reviewed the following report submitted for this project – *DRAFT Phase 1A Archaeological Documentary Study, Coastal and Social Resiliency Initiatives for the Tottenville Shoreline: Living Breakwaters and Tottenville Shoreline Protection Projects, Staten Island, Richmond County, New York* (AKRF, October 2016). We concur with the conclusions and recommendations of this report. Please continue to consult with this office as development of the project design proceeds.

In order to continue our review, at this time we request the following additional items:

1. Please provide more information on Conference House Park, including date of creation, identification of historic features, and any other documentation supportive of its potential historic significance.
2. Please provide an updated assessment of the vertical APE for the Breakwaters area in relation to the projected depths of suspected buried ground surfaces.
3. Please submit a final version of the Phase IA report, including historic site information to create a Unique Site Number (USN) in CRIS for the suspected shipwreck mentioned on page 8 of the report.

We would appreciate if the requested information could be provided via our Cultural Resource Information System (CRIS) at [www.nysparks.com/shpo/online-tools/](http://www.nysparks.com/shpo/online-tools/). Once on the CRIS site, you can log in as a guest and choose "submit" at the very top menu. Next choose "submit new information for an existing project". You will need this project number and your e-mail address. If you have any questions, I can be reached at (518) 268-2187 or [Larry.moss@parks.ny.gov](mailto:Larry.moss@parks.ny.gov)

Sincerely,



Larry K Moss, Historic Preservation Technical Specialist

CC: Mary Barthelme  
Amanda Sutphin, LPC  
Daniel Pagano, LPC  
Gina Santucci, LPC  
Amy Diehl Crader, AKRF  
Claudia Cooney, AKRF  
Elizabeth Meade, AKRF  
JoLayne Morneau, AKRF

## ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

**Project number:** GOVERNOR OFFICE STORM RECOVERY / 106-R  
**Project:** LIVING BREAKWATERS AND TOTTEVILLE DUNE PROJECTS  
**Date received:** 10/21/2016

**Comments:**

---

The LPC is in receipt of the DRAFT Phase 1A Archaeological Documentary Study Coastal and Social Resiliency Initiatives for the Tottenville Shoreline: Living Breakwaters and Tottenville Shoreline Protection Projects report dated October 2016, and the historic resource chapter of the EIS of 10/18/16.

LPC notes that the Woods House and the Biddle House appear S/NR eligible.

Regarding archaeology, LPC has reviewed the draft report and concur with its findings. We request notification when the project design is finalized along with documentation of the potential for impact in areas of documented archaeological sensitivity. Please submit a final version in both electronic and hardcopy format.

Cc: SHPO



11/9/2016

---

SIGNATURE  
Gina Santucci, Environmental Review Coordinator

DATE

**File Name:** 30215\_FSO\_GS\_11092016.doc

Close

**View and/or Address a Response**

**Project 15PR00618: Tottenville Shoreline, Staten Island (DHX4EELKMHMT)**

View Project

Please accept the following information below as the consolidated response from NYS SHPO for the above referenced submission.

**Review Responses**

Reviewer	Review Type	Response
Daria Merwin	Survey and Evaluation	Concur with direct and indirect APE for architectural resources.
Phillip Perazio	Archaeology	Based on the information provided, SHPO concurs with the "Direct Effect APE".
Larry Moss	Technical Services	The SHPO concurs regarding the definition of the APE for direct and indirect effects.

**Information Requests**

Process	Status	Reviewer	Review Type	Request Type	Request Entity	Request Item	Request Description
No Request Records							

**Attachments**

Attachment	Reviewer	Review Type	Type	Name	Description
No Attachment Records					